



**THE ROLE OF MUSLIM HEALTHCARE PROVIDERS IN THE
BIOETHICS DISCOURSE**

Ahsan Arozullah, MD, MPH
Initiative on Islam and Medicine' s (II&M)
2nd Annual Islamic Bioethics Workshop
June 7, 2015



Disclosure and Disclaimer

- Presenter is an employee of Astellas Pharma, Inc.
- Views and opinions expressed in this presentation are those of the presenter and should not be considered as a position of Astellas Pharma.
- This presentation does not involve Astellas Pharma in any manner.

What role do Muslim Healthcare providers play?

Individual level

- Content experts, Authors

- Consumers of discourse

Medical community level

- Professional healthcare societies

Community level

- Local and state ethics committees



Clinical epidemiology and health services research

Evidence-based medicine and practice

Drug safety/Pharmacovigilance

- Application of epidemiological methods

- Safety signal detection and evaluation

- Risk management

Benefit/Risk analysis



Muslim Healthcare provider participation in bioethics
Discuss major risks (safety first)
Definitions of benefit and risk
 Medical context
 Islamic context



Benefits

Muslim

Emotional attachment to the ideals
Belief in the principles

Healthcare Provider

Ability to frame questions
Ability to provide context

Risks

Muslim

Insufficient knowledge
Misinterpretation
Agenda


Healthcare Provider


Questions may not be important
Answers driven by context, instead of evidence





Definition of life
Differences in evidence
Context focused
Fatwa-based assessment (off label use)



		LIFE
<u>Medicine</u>	<u>Islamic Ethics</u>	
Life – 1 phase	Life – 3 phases	
Before birth	Before birth	
Life in the world	Life in the world	
	Life in the afterworld	
Standard	Standard	
Improve quality of life	Improve quality of life	
Extends length of life	Minimize risk to life	
End of life care	End of this life care	
		

		EVIDENCE
<u>Medicine</u>	<u>Islamic Ethics</u>	
Case series, observational studies, RCTs	Revelation	
Apply methods for weighing evidence	Quran	
Consistency	Sunnah	
Causality, threshold	Apply methods for weighing evidence	
Evidence evolves	Evidence static	
	Context evolves requiring applying evidence to new circumstances	
		

USE OF CONTEXT	
<p><u>Medicine</u></p> <p>Generate question</p> <p>Frame question</p> <p>Determine answer</p> <p>Apply answer</p>	<p><u>Islamic Ethics</u></p> <p>Generate question</p> <p>Frame question</p> <p>Determine answer</p> <p>Apply answer (fatwah)</p>
	

FATWA BASED REVIEW	
<p><u>Off label use</u></p> <p>Assess drug efficacy and safety</p> <p>Based on individual cases (anecdotal medicine)</p> <p>Driven by context</p> <p>Can provide useful information</p> <p>Can mislead with regard to establishing best practice</p>	<p><u>Fatwa based reviews</u></p> <p>Based on individual cases</p> <p>Contextualization of answer (hukm)</p> <p>May not directly reflect the answer</p> <p>Focus on exceptions, not the rule</p> <p>Hazardous if making policy</p>
	

Life support

- Fatwa allowed

- Not reflective of the evidence, but based on a secondary consideration (e.g. eating pork when dying)

- Primary evidence raises doubts

If one only studies fatawa

- May surmise that it is allowed AND reflects the evidence – false assumption

- Based on prior assumption, may lead to the impression that an obligation may exist



Muslim physician participation in bioethics

Discuss major risks (safety first)


Definitions of benefit and risk

- Medical context

- Islamic context




<u>Medicine</u>		<u>Islamic Ethics</u>	
Benefit		Benefit	
Improve QOL		Improve chances of salvation	
Prolong life		Something that promotes or enhances worship	
Something that promotes or enhances well-being			
Risk (harm)		Risk (sin)	
Decrease QOL		Decrease chances of salvation	
Decrease life			



DEFINITION OF BENEFIT AND RISK

<u>Benefits</u>		<u>Risks</u>	
Muslim		Definition of life	
Emotional attachment to the ideals		Differences in evidence	
Belief in the principles		Context focused	
Physician		Fatwa-based assessment (off label use)	
Ability to frame questions		Definition of benefit and risk	
Ability to provide context			



OVERALL BENEFIT/RISK

Expand scope

- Professionalism

- Patient advocacy focus

Learning

- Facilitate interdisciplinary discourse

- Clean slate – no agenda

Partnerships

