

CCTS 21002 – 01 / HIPS 21002
The Making of the “Good Physician”:
Multidisciplinary Perspectives on Vocation, Calling and the Pursuit of Clinical Excellence

“The practice of medicine is an art, not a trade; a calling, not a business; a calling in which your heart will be exercised equally with your head.” – Sir William Osler

“Can virtue be taught [to physicians]? Or if not, does it come by practice? Or does it come neither by practice nor by teaching, but...by nature, or in some other way? –Plato, The Meno

Spring 2016 (Mon/Wed 1:30-2:50pm)

W717 Conference Room (Section of Geriatrics and Palliative Care), Mitchell Hospital

(Enter through the Ellis Ave entrance near bookstore and work your way South, then West to the “A West” elevator to the 7th floor. To your right, enter the MacLean Center and the conference room will on your left at the end of the hallway).

Instructor: John D. Yoon, MD

Assistant Professor of Medicine, Department of Medicine

Office: University of Chicago Medicine/ Bernard Mitchell Hospital W314 (Section of Hospital Medicine)

Phone: 773-702-5197; E-mail: jdyoon@uchicago.edu

Office hours: By appointment, but generally Mon/Wed (after class)

Admin Assistant: Ana Lopez, 773-702-5173, alopez@bsd.uchicago.edu

Course Admin TA: Peter Boxley, pboxley@uchicago.edu

Writing TA/grader: Daniel Kim MA, MPH, dkim@medicine.bsd.uchicago.edu

Course Description: This multi-disciplinary course draws insights from medicine, sociology, moral psychology, philosophy, ethics and theology to explore answers to the unique challenges that medicine faces in the context of late modernity: How does one become a “good physician” in an era of growing moral pluralism and health care complexity? Students will engage relevant literature from across these disciplines to address issues regarding the legitimate goals of medicine, medical professionalism, the doctor-patient relationship, vocation and calling, the role of religion in medicine, and character development in medical education. The course will first introduce the challenges that moral pluralism in contemporary society presents to the profession of medicine along with the subsequent calls for a renewed pursuit of clinical excellence in today’s complex health care system. It will then survey the resurgence of a philosophical discipline (virtue ethics) that has begun to shape contemporary debate regarding what types of “excellences” are needed for a good medical practice dominated by medical science and technology. Students will examine scholarship in three primary areas: First, students will examine traditional religious accounts (from Judaism, Christianity, and Islam) both of medicine and of moral formation, to consider how they might inform answer to the question, *How does one become (and remain) a good physician?* Second, students will examine recent research in the field of moral psychology that is shaping contemporary views regarding moral and professional formation and identity. Finally, students will examine studies from the vocational psychology literature on work motivation, focusing particularly on the construct of calling and its application to the pursuit of clinical excellence in medicine.

Course Materials: All readings are journal articles or book excerpts and are available through the university library’s electronic resources or on Chalk. In addition, several books may be recommended as optional reading.

Course Requirements and Grading. Course pre-requisite: Students must have already completed SOSC sequence. Grades will be based on four requirements, each of which accounts for approximately 25% of the final grade: (1) class attendance/participation, (2) weekly abstracts (3) midterm (4) the final paper,

(1) Students should attend and participate in class discussions. Depending on the size of the class, discussions may begin with short (~ 5-10 minute) oral presentations in which students are assigned to introduce the topic of discussion for that week and summarize readings for the benefit of the class.

(2) Students will be required to write one abstract (500 words max) per week based on one or more of that week's readings. I anticipate readings each week to be no more than a 50-60 pages. A *Question of the Week* will be formulated to help focus your responses. Abstracts (9 total) must be submitted through Chalk by 11:59pm the day prior to the scheduled discussion. [0 points if no abstract is turned in; 1 point if only a summary without response, or response without thoughtful summary; 2 points for summary & response.]

(3) Midterm. This will be a take-home midterm in which you will be asked to write a well-reasoned (or empirically supported) response to one of the nine "*Questions of the Week*" in the course. In your midterm, you are encouraged to respond to the Optional Articles listed for each week's Question, or conduct your own literature review to help support your argument (4-6 pg double-spaced)

(4) Final paper (10-12 pg double-spaced), due on the last day of the quarter (earlier for graduating fourth years). This paper can address a topic from one of the core themes of the course or, with instructor consent, another related topic of interest to the student. (See paper instructions below)

Bonus points will be given if you attend an on-campus talk, conference, or event with obvious relevance to the course, and you subsequently submit a summary/critique of the event. I have listed the quarter's schedule for the [Program on Medicine and Religion](#) (see also Appendix), [MacLean Center for Clinical Medical Ethics](#), and the [Bucksbaum Institute of Clinical Excellence](#), any of which would qualify for the bonus opportunity.

Course Final Paper:

Option 1: Students may take a typical term paper approach (ask a research question, and then answer it in 10+ pages). There are many excellent general guides to help you think about writing projects, such as former UC prof Wayne Booth's legendary *The Craft of Research* (2008), as well as more focused guides such as Howard Becker's highly personal and humorous *Writing for Social Scientists* (1986), Becker's *Tricks of the Trade: How to Think about Your Research While You're Doing It* (1998), or Robert Alford's more formal *The Craft of Inquiry* (1998). Some students may be preparing a BA paper. With the consent of the instructor, you may choose to study the topic of your BA paper through a different theoretical or empirical lens. Alternatively, you may write a research proposal outlining how you would go about finding the answer to your question(s). There are many good guides to writing proposals, including, for example, Sage Publication's *Proposal Writing, 3rd Ed* (2007). For third year students contemplating a 4th year BA paper, this exercise might be a good way to get a head start on the process of writing a research proposal. You could also perform a Systematic Literature Review on a topic discussed in this course and summarize the findings of your research while also drawing your own conclusions. (BEME Guide No 3, Medical Teacher, Vol 25, No. 4, July 2003) Key advice for the class paper is to choose something you are interested in and pursue the topic with diligence.

Option 2: Based on readings from the course and your own research, you may advance a theoretically reasoned or empirically based argument answering the question: "*In light of the growing complexity of the health care system and moral pluralism in medicine, how does one become a good physician?*"

Some topic ideas to get you thinking, others of your choosing may be allowed with instructor consent:

- How should medical educators address issues of character in medical education?
- What differences, if any, do physicians' religious traditions and commitments make with respect to their clinical practices and the question of becoming a good physician?
- Should clinicians in a pluralistic society like our own practice in ways that are self-consciously grounded in and informed by religious traditions? (Why or why not?)
- What would it mean to rightly set the practice of medicine in the context of a good (virtuous, ethical, and/or faithful) life?

“Life in Medicine: A View from the Trenches” Lecture Series for the Good Physician Course

All guest lectures will be held in the W717 Conference Room (Section of Geriatrics and Palliative Care) in Mitchell. If you are not a student in the course but would like to attend one of these talks, please first RSVP to pboxley@uchicago.edu to ensure that we have space to accommodate you.

Invited Guest Speakers

Mon April 4th (1:30pm-2:30pm)

Daniel Brauner, MD

Medicine (Geriatrics)

Mon April 11th (1:30pm-2:30pm)

H. Barrett Fromme, MD

Pediatrics

Mon April 18th (1:30pm-2:30pm)

Anne Hong, MD

Medicine (Primary Care)

Mon April 25th (1:30pm-2:30pm)

Kirk Spencer, MD

Medicine (Cardiology)

Mon May 2nd (1:30pm-2:30pm)

Christopher Clardy, MD

Pediatrics

Mon May 9th (1:30pm-2:30pm)

Jessica Ridgway, MD

Medicine (Infectious Disease)

Mon May 16th (1:30pm-2:30pm)

Jonathan Lio, MD & Christine Jun, MD & Brian Callender, MD

Hospital Medicine (Global Health panel)

Wed May 25th (1:30pm-2:30pm)

David Song, MD

Plastic & Reconstructive Surgery

Wed June 1st (1:30pm-2:30pm)

Peter Angelos, MD

Endocrine Surgery

COURSE SCHEDULE & READINGS**WEEK 1: Introduction and Course Overview****Mon March 28th (1:30-2:50pm)**

Required reading: None

Wed March 30th (1:30-2:50pm)Worldviews, Virtues, and Professional Development in Medical Education**Required reading:** These articles introduce the main themes of the course as well as a proposal for medical education to involve students into an active awareness of and engagement with the underlying worldviews that shape medicine and its practitioners.*Tilburt J, Geller G. Viewpoint: The importance of worldviews for medical education. Acad Med. 2007;82:819-822.**Curlin, FA. A Case for Studying the Relationship Between Religion and the Practice of Medicine. Acad Med. 2008;83(12):1118-1120.***Optional Reading:** The optional articles listed here paint a picture of the “Good Physician” from the perspective of two distinguished clinicians in the history of medicine (Peabody and Tumulty). The third reading describes one of medicine’s most famous exemplars of the good physician, Sir William Osler. The final articles (Curlin and Yoon) describe empirical studies investigating the correlation between doctors’ worldviews and their clinical practices. The purpose of these readings is to spark preliminary reflections on what it means to be a good physician in the context of contemporary medicine.*Peabody, F.W. (1927). The Care of the Patient. JAMA, 88: 877-882.**Tumulty, P.A. (1970). What is a clinician and what does he do? N Engl J Med., 283 (1): 20-24.**Bryan, Charles. Osler: Inspirations from a Great Physician. Oxford University Press (1997). (Read Ch. 1-2 (pgs. 1-58).**Yoon JD, Rasinski KA, Curlin FA. Moral controversy, directive counsel, and the doctor’s role: findings from a national survey of obstetricians-gynecologists. Academic Medicine (2010);85:1475-81.**Curlin FA et al. Religion, Conscience, and Controversial Clinical Practices. New England Journal of Medicine 356;6(2007):593-600.***No Abstract Due this Week****OPTIONAL:** Program on Medicine and Religion Lecture Series

Location: W732 (MacLean Center conference room, in the old Billings Hospital)

Wed March 30th (11am-11:50am) – Daniel Sulmasy MD, PhD
“The Intersection of Religion & Biomedicine”

WEEK 2: “The Good Physician” and Confronting the Challenges of Moral Pluralism in Medicine**Mon April 4th (1:30-2:50pm)****Daniel Brauner, MD**

Medicine (Geriatrics)

Wed April 6th (1:30-2:50pm)

Required reading: These articles present a complex narrative of the contemporary state of medicine and the challenges that moral pluralism presents to society’s pursuit of achieving moral consensus regarding the goals of medicine. The first article (Curlin) presents this narrative through philosophical argument; the second (Berry) through historical fiction.

Curlin F, Hall D. The Limits of Consensus: Expanding technology, moral pluralism, and the future of medicine (working paper, unpublished manuscript).

Berry, Wendell. “Fidelity: Five Stories”, 1993.

Optional Reading: The optional articles (Kass, Berry) provide students an opportunity to further explore themes related to the articles in the required readings. The final articles (Siegler, Emmanuel, Quill, Kaldjian, Kenny) present a variety of practical proposals for how clinicians might navigate the doctor-patient relationship in light of moral pluralism in medicine.

Kass, Leon. Regarding the End of Medicine and the Pursuit of Health. The Public Interest (1975).

Berry, Wendell. “Health is Membership,” in The Art of the Common Place: The Agrarian Essays of Wendell Berry, ed. Norman Wirzba (Washington, DC: Counterpoint, 2002), 144-158.

Siegler M. Searching for moral certainty in medicine: a proposal for a new model of the doctor-patient encounter. Bull N Y Acad Med 1981;57:56e69.

Emmanuel, Ezekiel. Four Models of the Physician-Patient Relationship. JAMA 1992;267(16):2221

Quill H & Brody H. Physician Recommendations and Patient Autonomy: Finding a balance between Physician Power and Patient Choice. Annals of Internal Medicine 1996;125:763-769

Kaldjian, Lauris. Teaching practical wisdom in medicine through clinical judgment, goals of care, and ethical reasoning. Journal of Medical Ethics (2010);36:558-562.

Kenny, N. "Searching for Doctor Good: Virtues for the Twenty-First Century." Lost Virtue: Professional Character Development in Medical Education. Eds. Kenny, Nuala and Wayne Shelton. Vol. 10. Oxford: Elsevier Ltd., 2006.

Abstract #1 due (Tues 11:59pm): Abstract/summary/critique of one (or more) of the readings from this week.

Question of the Week: In light of the challenges raised by these readings, how would you define the purpose or goals of medicine?

OPTIONAL: Program on Medicine and Religion Lecture Series

Location: W732 (MacLean Center conference room, in the old Billings Hospital)

Wed April 6th (10:00-10:50am) – Daniel Kim, MA, MPH

“The History of Medicine and Religion at the AMA and the University of Chicago”

WEEK 3: Medical “Professionalism” and State of the Medical Vocation**Mon April 11th (1:30-2:50pm)****H. Barrett Fromme, MD**

Pediatrics

Wed April 13th (1:30-2:50pm)**Required Reading:** These articles introduce the “professionalism” crisis in medical education, organized medicine’s attempts to form “good doctors,” and the arguments raised by critics of the professionalism movement in medicine.*Kinghorn, W. A., et al. "Professionalism in Modern Medicine: Does the Emperor Have Any Clothes?" Acad Med 82.1 (2007):40-5.**Coulehan J. Viewpoint: today's professionalism: engaging the mind but not the heart. Acad Med. Oct 2005;80(10):892-898.***Optional Reading:** The optional articles provide a variety of perspectives toward medical professionalism from the perspective of leaders in academic medicine (Inui, Humphrey, Stern/Papadakis, Physician Charter, Huddle). Some of the other articles describe distinct challenges to ethics/professionalism movements in medicine (Kass, Hafferty, Brainard, Reddy).*Inui, TS. A Flag in the Wind: Educating for Professionalism in Medicine. Washington, DC: Association of American Medical Colleges, 2003.**Humphrey HJ, Smith K, Reddy S, Scott D, Madara JL, Arora VM. Promoting an environment of professionalism: The University of Chicago ‘Roadmap.’ Acad Med 2007;82:1098-1107.**Stern DT & Papadakis M. The Developing Physician- Becoming a Professional. New England Journal of Medicine.2006;355:1794-9.**Medical Professionalism Project. "Medical Professionalism in the New Millennium: A Physicians' Charter." Annals of Internal Medicine 136 (3): 243-246, 2002.**Huddle, T. S., and Education Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical. "Viewpoint: Teaching Professionalism: Is Medical Morality a Competency?" Acad Med 80.10 (2005): 885-91.**Reddy, Shalini et al. Third-Year Medical Students’ Participation in and Perceptions of Unprofessional Behaviors. Acad Med 82 (10) 2007:S35-S39.**Kass, L. R. "Practicing Ethics: Where's the Action?" Hastings Cent Rep 20.1 (1990): 5-12.**Hafferty, F. W., and R. Franks. "The Hidden Curriculum, Ethics Teaching, and the Structure of Medical Education." Acad Med 69.11 (1994): 861-71.**Brainard AH, Brislen HC. Viewpoint: learning professionalism: a view from the trenches. Acad Med. Nov 2007;82(11):1010-1014.***Abstract #2 due (Tues 11:59pm): One page abstract/summary/critique of one (or more, your choice) of the readings from this week.****Question of the Week:** This week’s readings seem to suggest that the project to instill ethics and professionalism in medical students is providing an “*easy solution to every human problem [that is] neat, plausible and wrong.*” Do you agree or disagree? (Explain)

OPTIONAL: Program on Medicine and Religion Lecture Series

Location: W732 (MacLean Center conference room, in the old Billings Hospital)

Wed April 13th (10:00-10:50am) – Rabbi Yossi Brackiman

“Jewish Perspectives on Medicine and Bioethics”

WEEK 4: The Rise of Virtue Ethics**Mon April 18th (1:30-2:50pm)****Anne Hong, MD**

Medicine (Primary Care)

Wed April 20th (1:30-2:50pm)**Required reading:** This session will examine the resurgence of a philosophical discipline called virtue ethics and introduce the concept of virtues or “excellences” in medicine.

Pellegrino E. Character formation and the making of good physicians. In: Kenny N, Shelton W, eds. Lost Virtue: Professional Character Development in Medical Education. Vol 10. Oxford: Elsevier Ltd.; 2006 (Read Introduction and Ch. 1 pgs 1-15)

Veatch R. Character Formation in Professional Education: A Word of Caution. In: Kenny N, Shelton W, eds. Lost Virtue: Professional Character Development in Medical Education. Vol 10. Oxford: Elsevier Ltd.; 2006 (Read Ch. 3 pgs 29-45)

Optional Reading: The first two articles introduce the writings and subsequent influence of moral philosopher MacIntyre and the renewal of virtue ethics (MacIntyre and Bishop). Other articles argue from a virtue ethics perspective on the importance of role models (Toon, Zagzebski, Haidet, Kinghorn, Sulmasy). The final article describes an empirical study on medical students opinions on character development (Carey).

MacIntyre A. After Virtue: A Study in Moral Theory. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame; 2002, Third Edition (Read Prologue, Ch 1-2, pgs. 1-22).

Bishop, JP. Waiting for St. Benedict Among the Ruins: MacIntyre and Medical Practice. Journal of Medicine and Philosophy 36 (2011):107-113. (journal series)

Toon, P. D. "Towards a Philosophy of General Practice: A Study of the Virtuous Practitioner." Royal College of General Practitioners, April 1999 (Read Ch. 6-9: pgs.32-64).

Zagzebski L. Exemplarist Virtue Theory. Metaphilosophy 2010; Vol 41 (1-2):41-57.

Haidet P, Stein HF. The role of the student-teacher relationship in the formation of physicians. The hidden curriculum as process. J Gen Intern Med. Jan 2006;21 Suppl 1:S16-20

Kinghorn, W.A. Medical Education as Moral Formation: An Aristotelian Account of Medical Professionalism. Perspectives in Biology and Medicine, Vol. 53, No. 1(2010): 87-105

Sulmasy DP. Should Medical Schools be Schools for Virtue? Journal of General Internal Medicine (2000); 15:514-515.

Carey GB. Medical student opinions on character development in medical education: a national survey. BMC Research Notes. 2015;8:455.

Abstract #3 due (Tues 11:59pm): Abstract/summary/critique of one (or more) of the readings from this week.**Question of the Week:** How does the approach of virtue ethics help or hinder thinking about the formation of good physicians?

OPTIONAL: Program on Medicine and Religion Lecture Series

Location: W732 (MacLean Center conference room, in the old Billings Hospital)

Wed April 20th (10:00-10:50am) – Wayne Detmer, MD

“Protestant Perspectives on Medicine and Bioethics”

WEEK 5: Introduction to Religion and the Practice of Medicine**Mon April 25th (1:30-2:50pm)****Kirk Spencer, MD**

Medicine (Cardiology)

Wed April 27th (1:30-2:50pm)

Required Reading: This week introduces another primary theme of this course, namely the role of religion and spirituality in the practice of medicine. The assigned readings are meant to spark reflection and discussion on the relationship between religion and medicine in the professional formation of physicians.

Sulmasy DP. Is Medicine a Spiritual Practice? Academic Medicine 1999;74:1002-1005.

Scheurich, N. Reconsidering Spirituality and Medicine. Acad Med. 2003;78:356-360.

Optional Readings: These first three authors (Ferngren, Imber, Cadge) offer a historical perspective on the interaction of religion and medicine in the development of the profession. The final three articles offer opposing perspectives on the role of religion/spirituality in medicine (Curlin, Savulescu and Sloan).

Ferngren G. Medicine and religion: a historical perspective. In Oxford Textbook of Spirituality in Healthcare, 2012.

Imber, Jonathan B. Trusting Doctors: The Decline of Moral Authority in American Medicine. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008. (read excerpt)

Cadge, Wendy. Paging God-Religion in the Halls of Medicine (Ch. 1-2), The University of Chicago Press, 2012.

Curlin FA. "Social brain, spiritual medicine" in Invisible Forces and Powerful Beliefs: Gravity, Gods and Minds (The Chicago Social Brain Network), 2010. (Read Ch. 15, pgs 1-7.)

Savulescu, J. Two worlds apart: religion and ethics. Journal of Medical Ethics. 1998;24:382-384.

Sloan, Richard. Blind Faith: The Unholy Alliance of Religion and Medicine, 2006 (Ch 10-11, 14)

Video: Spirituality, Religious Wisdom, and the Care of the Patient

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gity6M9_7eY&feature=youtu.be

OPTIONAL: Program on Medicine and Religion Lecture Series

Location: W732 (MacLean Center conference room, in the old Billings Hospital)

Wed April 27th (10:00-10:50am) – Aasim Padela, MD

“Islamic Perspectives on Medicine and Bioethics”

Abstract #4 due (Tues 11:59pm): Abstract/summary/critique of one (or more) of the readings from this week.

Question of the Week: What proper role (if any) does religion/spirituality have in the scientific practice of medicine?

TAKE-HOME MIDTERM due Friday Apr 29th (11:59pm)

WEEK 6: Religion, Calling and the Practice of Medicine (Islam)

“... Give us the understanding that ours is a profession sacred that deals with your most precious gifts of life and intellect. Therefore, make us worthy of this favoured station with honor, dignity and piety so that we may devote our lives in serving mankind, poor or rich, literate or illiterate, Muslim or non-Muslim, black or white with patience and tolerance with virtue and reverence, with knowledge and vigilance, with Thy love in our hearts and compassion for Thy servants, Thy most precious creation...”

-Excerpts from the Oath of a Muslim Physician, Islamic Medical Association of N. America

"Do not dwell in a country that does not accommodate a theologian and a physician" - Imam Al-Shafi

Mon May 2nd (1:30-2:50pm)

Christopher Clardy, MD

Pediatrics

Wed May 4th (1:30-2:50pm)

Required Reading:

Ferngren G and Tavakol M, *Islam in the Middle Ages (Ch. 6 in Medicine and Religion: A Historical Introduction, 2014)*

Padela A et al. *Religious identity and workplace discrimination: A National Survey of Muslim physicians. AJOB Empirical Bioethics, 2015.*

Video by Aasim Padela: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hHfcyhBgycU>

Optional Reading:

Padela, A. *Islamic Medical Ethics: A Primer. Bioethics (2007) Vol 21: pgs 169-178.*

Waugh, Earle. *The Islamic tradition: Religious Beliefs and Healthcare Decisions, Park Ridge Center for the Study of Health, Faith, and Ethics*

Ahmed, Abdul Aziz. *Health and disease: an Islamic framework. Ch 3 in Sheikh, A. & Gatrad, A.R. (Eds.), Caring for Muslim Patients, Second Edition. Oxford: Radcliffe Publishing (2008) (Read pages 35-43)*

Hanson, H.Y. *Principles of Islamic Bioethics. Ch. 4 in Sheikh, A. & Gatrad, A.R. (Eds.), Caring for Muslim Patients, Second Edition. Oxford: Radcliffe Publishing. (2008) (Read pages 45-53)*

Levey, M. (1967). *Medical Ethics of Medieval Islam with Special Reference to Al-Ruhawi's "Practical Ethics of the Physician."* *Transactions of the American Philosophical Society held at Philadelphia for promoting useful knowledge, New Series—Volume 57, Part 3, May 1967. (Read pgs. 1-13).*

Rahman, Fazlur. *The Religious Valuation of Medicine (1998). Health and Medicine in the Islamic Tradition: Change and Identity. ABC Group International, Inc. (read pgs. 29-40).*

Rispler-Chaim, V (1993). *Islamic Medical Ethics in the Twentieth Century. Leiden, The Netherlands: E.J. Brill. (Read Ch. 7 – "Doctor-Patient Relations" pgs. 62-71).*

Hindu, A. *The Key to Medicine and a Guide for Students. Reading, U.K.: Garnet Publishing Limited. translated by Dr. Aida Tibi and reviewed by Prof. Emilie Savage-Smith, 2011.(medieval Islamic text)*

Question of the Week: How does the Islamic tradition answer the question, “What does it mean to be a good physician in the context of a faithful Muslim life?”

Abstract #5 due (Tues 11:59pm): Abstract/summary/critique of one (or more) of the readings from this week.

OPTIONAL: Program on Medicine and Religion Lecture Series

Location: W732 (MacLean Center conference room, in the old Billings Hospital)

Wed May 4th (10:00-10:50am) – George Fitchett & Marsha Sumner - “Health Care Chaplaincy”

Wed May 4th (11:00-11:50am) – Ray Williams - “Jehovah’s Witnesses and Medicine”

WEEK 7: Religion, Calling and the Practice of Medicine (Judaism)

“The eternal providence has appointed me to watch over the life and health of Thy creatures. May the love for my art actuate me at all time; may neither avarice nor miserliness, nor thirst for glory or for a great reputation engage my mind; for the enemies of truth and philanthropy could easily deceive me and make me forgetful of my lofty aim of doing good to Thy children. May I never see in the patient anything but a fellow creature in pain. Grant me the strength, time and opportunity always to correct what I have acquired, always to extend its domain; for knowledge is immense and the spirit of man can extend indefinitely to enrich itself daily with new requirements. Today he can discover his errors of yesterday and tomorrow he can obtain a new light on what he thinks himself sure of today. Oh, God, Thou has appointed me to watch over the life and death of Thy creatures; here am I ready for my vocation and now I turn unto my calling.” –Oath of Maimonides

Mon May 9th (1:30-2:50pm)

Jessica Ridgway, MD

Medicine (Infectious Disease)

Wed May 11th (1:30-2:50pm)

Required Reading:

Dorff, Elliot. Medicine in the Context of a Faithful Jewish Community. Unpublished Manuscript [In Press]
Astrow, AB. Jewish Values, Empathy, and the Doctor-Patient Relationship. Soc (2015) 52:418-423.

Optional Reading:

Astrow, AB. Is Medicine a Spiritual Vocation? Society April 2013 Vol 50 (2):pg 101-105. University Press, 1998).

Dorff, Elliot. Matters of Life and Death: A Jewish Approach to Modern Medical Ethics. The Jewish Publication Society, 1998 (Read Ch. 1-2, pgs 1-34).

Dorff, Elliot. The Jewish Tradition: Religious Beliefs and Healthcare Decisions, Park Ridge Center for the Study of Health, Faith, and Ethics

Glick, Shimon. Who Decides – The Physician or the Rabbi? ASSIA – Jewish Medical Ethics Vol VI, No. 2, 2004, pg 20-30.

Heschel, Abraham. The Patient as Person (speech to American Medical Association, 113th Convention, 1964). in The Insecurity of Freedom: Essays on Human Existence, First Noonday Press, 1967 (pgs 24-38).

Levinas, Emmanuel, The Rights of Man and Good Will in Entre Nous: On Thinking-of-the-Other, Columbia
Rosner, F. (1995). Medicine in the Bible and Talmud: Selections from Classical Jewish Sources. Hoboken, NJ: KTAV Publishing House, Inc. (Read Part IV-V: Physicians, Ethics and Prayers & Famous Physicians in the Talmud (pp 101-172).

Simon, Steven R. Moses Maimonides: Medieval Physician and Scholar. Archives of Internal Medicine. Vol 159 (1999):1841-1845.

Videos: Shimon click, Avraham Steingberg, or Eddie Reichman, Eisenberg

OPTIONAL: Program on Medicine and Religion Lecture Series

Location: W732 (MacLean Center conference room, in the old Billings Hospital)

Wed May 11th (10:00am-10:50am) John Hardt, PhD

“Catholic Perspectives on Medicine and Bioethics”

Abstract #6 due (Tues 11:59pm): Abstract/summary/critique of one (or more) of the readings from this week.

Question of the Week: How does the Jewish tradition answer the question, “What does it mean to be a good physician in the context of a faithful Jewish life?”

WEEK 8: Religion, Calling and the Practice of Medicine (Christianity)

"It becomes every man who purposes to give himself to the care of others, seriously to consider the four following things: First, that he must one day give an account to the Supreme Judge of all the lives entrusted to his care. Secondly, that all his skill and knowledge, and energy as they have been given by God, so that they should be exercised for His glory, and the good of mankind, and not for mere gain or ambition. Thirdly, and not more beautifully than truly, let him reflect that he has undertaken the care of no mean creature, for, in order that he may estimate the value, the greatness of the human race, the only begotten son of God became himself a man, and thus ennobled it with His divine dignity. And fourthly, that the doctor being himself a mortal man, should be diligent and tender in relieving his suffering patients, inasmuch as himself must one day be a like sufferer." -Thomas Sydenham (1642-1689)

Mon May 16th (1:30-2:50pm)

Jonathan Lio, MD & Christine Jun, MD

Hospital Medicine (Global Health panel)

Wed May 18th (1:30-2:50pm)

Required Reading:

Hauerwas, S. "Salvation and Health: Why Medicine Needs the Church" in "Suffering Presence: Theological Reflections on Medicine, the Mentally Handicapped and the Church", 1986.

Verhey, A & Kinghorn, W. "The Hope to Which He Has Called You": Medicine in Christian Apocalyptic Context. *Christian Bioethics*, 2016;22(1):21-38.

Optional Reading:

Hauerwas S & McKenny G. *The Strength to Be Patient*. *Christian Bioethics*, 2016;22(1):5-20.

Sulmasy DP. *Exousia: Healing with authority in the Christian tradition*. In: GP McKenny and JR Sande (eds): *Theological Analyses of the Clinical Encounter*, Kluwer Academic Publishers 1994;pp 85-107.

Curlin FA "How Shall We Then Practice?" *Journal of Health and Development*

Curlin FA. What Does Any of This Have to Do with Being a Physician? *Kierkegaardian Irony and the Practice of Medicine*. *Christian Bioethics*, 2016;22(1):62-79.

Curlin FA & Meador K. *Setting Medicine in the Context of a Faithful Christian Life*. *Christian Bioethics [Special Issue]* 2016.

Schuman Joel, Volck Brian. *Reclaiming the Body: Christians and the Faithful Use of Modern Medicine*. Brazos Press, 2006. (Read Ch. 1-2, pgs 13-40.)

Hardt J. *The Healing Professions/Medicine*. Transcript from Nov 8, 2007. President's Council on Bioethics (<http://bioethics.georgetown.edu/pcbe/transcripts/nov07/session2.html>).

Sulmasy DP. *A Balm For Gilead: Meditations on Spirituality and the Healing Arts*. Georgetown University Press, 2007 (Read Ch.1-3, pages 1-27).

Ferngren, G. "Early Christianity" in *Medicine and Religion: A Historical Introduction*, Johns Hopkins University Press, 2014 (Ch. 4).

Abstract #7 due (Tues 11:59pm): Abstract/summary/critique of one (or more) of the readings from this week. (Proposals for your final paper are due Fri May 20th noon).

Question of the Week: How does the Christian tradition answer the question, "What does it mean to be a good physician in the context of a faithful Christian life?"

WEEK 9: Moral Psychology and the Formation of “Good Physicians”: Insights on Character Development and Implications for Medical Education

Mon May 23rd (1:30-2:50pm)

Required Readings: These final articles introduce the role of moral psychology in informing the questions: “How can medical virtues be developed or formed in physicians?”

Haidt J. The emotional dog and its rational tail: a social intuitionist approach to moral judgment. Psychol Rev. Oct 2001;108(4):814-834

Leffel GM, Rasinski KA, Curlin FA, Yoon JD. Relevance of the rationalist-intuitionist debate for ethics and professionalism in medical education. Advances in Health Science Education. 2014 Oct 16

Optional Readings:

Haidt J. The new synthesis in moral psychology. Science. May 18 2007;316(5827):998-1002

Narvaez, D. Moral Complexity: The Fatal Attraction of Truthiness and the Importance of Mature Moral Functioning. Perspectives on Psychological Science 2010;5(2):163-181.

Haidt J. Moral Psychology Must Not Be Based on Faith and Hope: Commentary on Narvaez (2010):182-184.

Narvaez, D. The Embodied Dynamism of Moral Becoming: Reply to Haidt (2010):185-186.

Haidt J. The moral emotions. In: Davidson R, Scherer K, Goldsmith H, eds. Handbook of affective sciences. Oxford, England: Oxford University Press; 2002

Bryan CS, Babelay AM. Building character: a model for reflective practice. Acad Med. Sep 2009;84(9):1283-1288

Leffel, Michael. Beyond Meaning: Spiritual Transformation in the Paradigm of Moral Intuitionism: A New Direction for the Psychology of Spiritual Transformation. Research in the Social Scientific Study of Religion Vol 22.

Wed May 25th (1:30-2:50pm)

David Song, MD

Plastic & Reconstructive Surgery

Abstract #8 due (Sun 11:59pm): Abstract/summary/critique of one (or more) of the readings from this week.

Question of the Week: What role, if any, do the theory and findings from the field of moral psychology have in informing the task of medical educators? (Explain)

WEEK 10: The historical origins and contemporary measurement of vocation (calling)**Mon May 30th (1:30-2:50pm)**

MEMORIAL DAY HOLIDAY [No Class]

Wed June 1st (1:30-2:50pm)**Peter Angelos, MD**

Endocrine Surgery

How is the concept of vocation, or calling, relevant to contemporary medical practice? In this final week, we will discuss the vocational science behind a “sense of calling,” as well as read one critic’s assessment (Carl Elliot) of the downside of viewing medicine as a calling.

Dik, Bryan & Duffy Ryan. (2012) Make Your Job a Calling: How the Psychology of Vocation Can Change Your Life at Work. Read Part I (pg. 1-44).

Elliot, Carl. Disillusioned Doctors. In: Kenny N, Shelton W, eds. Lost Virtue: Professional Character Development in Medical Education. Vol 10. Oxford: Elsevier Ltd.; 2006:87-97.

Optional Readings:

Gustafson, J.M. (1982) Professions as “Callings.” The Social Service Review, Vol. 56, No. 4 (Dec. 1982), pp. 501-515

Ratanawongsa N, Howell EE, Wright SM. What motivates physicians throughout their careers in medicine? Compr Ther. Winter 2006;32(4):210-217.

Rasinski KA, Lawrence RE, Yoon, JD, Curlin FA. A sense of calling and primary care physicians’ satisfaction in treating smoking, alcoholism, and obesity. Arch Intern Med Aug 27 (2012):1-2

Ravella R, Curlin FA, Yoon JD. Medical School Ranking and Medical Student Vocational Identity. Teaching and Learning in Medicine. 2015;27(2):123-9.

Curlin FA, Serrano KD, Baker MG, Carricaburu SL, Smucker DR, Chin MH. Following the call: how providers make sense of their decisions to work in faith-based and secular urban community health centers. J Health Care Poor Underserved. Nov 2006;17(4):944-957.

Wrzesniewski, A. et al. (1997) Jobs, Careers, and Callings: People’s Relations to Their Work. Journal of Research in Personality, 31, 21-33

Yoon JD, Daley B, Curlin FA. The association between a sense of calling and physician well-being: A national study of primary care physicians and psychiatrists. Academic Psychiatry. 2016 [in press].

Yoon JD, Shin JH, Nian AL, Curlin FA. Religion, Sense of Calling and the Practice of Medicine: Findings from a National Survey of Primary Care Physicians’ and Psychiatrists. Southern Medical Journal. 2015;108(3):189-95.

Abstract #9 due (Sun 11:59pm): Abstract/summary/critique of one (or more) of the readings from this week.

Question of the Week: Should medicine be viewed as a *calling*? Why or why not?

Final Paper Due on June 10th by noon

(Graduating Fourth years: Final Paper due Thursday June 2nd by noon)

Appendix:

I. Program on Medicine and Religion Seminar Series

<http://pmr.uchicago.edu/page/2015-2016-seminar-series>

II. Bucksbaum Institute for Clinical Excellence Lectures

<http://bucksbauminstitute.uchicago.edu/calendar>

III. MacLean Center for Clinical Medical Ethics Lectures

<http://goo.gl/1CQMjz>

IV. Optional Video Series on the “Good Physician” (for additional classroom discussion)

Brief Description of “*Jewel in the Palace*” ([http://www.dramafever.com/drama/19/Jewel in the Palace](http://www.dramafever.com/drama/19/Jewel_in_the_Palace))
Set in the 15th century, the historical epic chronicles one orphaned young woman’s triumphant rise from a humble cook in the royal court to the king’s first female physician. We may make use of these video clips to help stimulate discussion on various themes addressed in this course. The entire TV drama series contain 54 episodes total (1 hour per episode). Episode 30 begins when Jang Geum (main protagonist) finds herself exiled to an island after being falsely accused of a crime in the royal court while she was a cook. This episode marks Jang Geum’s “calling” to become a physician.

- 1) Episodes 30-32: Pre-medical training: “*A person filled with anger cannot become a physician?*”
Classroom showing [Episode 31](#): first couple minutes (0:00-3:36)
- 2) Episodes 33-34: Medical training: “*Only a humble physician is a true physician?*”
Classroom showing [Episode 34](#): first couple minutes (0:00-9:15)

V. Resources and Links for Further Study:

- A New Science of Virtues (Arete Initiative at the University of Chicago)
<http://scienceofvirtues.org/Arete/ResearchGrants.aspx>
- Practice and Profession Symposium (Program on Medicine and Religion)
<http://pmr.uchicago.edu/page/practice-and-profession-symposium>
- Moral Foundations Theory (Jonathan Haidt): contains fascinating surveys on morality
<http://www.moralfoundations.org/>
- Association of American Medical Colleges (all kinds of data and reports on medical education)
<https://www.aamc.org/data/>
- American Osler Society (dedicated to the great physician, Sir William Osler)
<http://www.americanosler.org/>
- Arnold P. Gold Foundation (dedicating to promoting humanism in medicine)
<http://humanism-in-medicine.org/>
- Initiative on Islam and Medicine (student research internships available!)
<https://pmr.uchicago.edu/iim>
- Project on the Good Physician (Program on Medicine and Religion)
<https://pmr.uchicago.edu/projects/research/good-physician>